

AGENDA
ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. ROLL CALL

All Commissioners present.

2. CONSENT CALENDAR

The Commission will take action on the consent calendar in one motion. If you want to speak on a consent calendar item, or want action other than that indicated, please make your request at this time.

- a. Approval of the December 5, 2001 Synopsis

The synopsis was unanimously approved with three revisions (7-0-0 unanimous). The word “its” should be deleted from the final recommendation under item 4.c. and a typographical error should be revised to read discovery rather than discover on page 3.

3. ORAL PETITIONS

This portion of the agenda is reserved for persons desiring to address the Commission on any matter not on the agenda. Speakers are limited to 2 minutes. The law does not permit Commission action or extended discussion on any item not on the agenda except under special circumstances. If Commission action is requested, the matter can be placed on the next agenda. All statements that require a response will be referred to staff for reply in writing.

None.

4. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- a. HP01-11-017. Historic Preservation permit to allow minor exterior modifications and replacement of a storefront on the Twohy Building City Landmark (HL01-134) on a 0.20 gross acre site located at 200-210 S. First Street. Owner: Redevelopment Agency. Developer: CIM Group. Council District: 3. CEQA: Exempt.

Ms. Damkroger presented the project proposal to the Commission and noted that staff is supportive of the project because it is consistent with Secretary of the Interior’s Standard #9. Gene Eagle, project manager for the CIM Group, was available to answer questions. Chair Wachtel commented that she believes the brushed aluminum finish is reminiscent of the 1950’s era and appears too contemporary. Commissioner Paim asked if the marble base at the entry matches the color of the marble on the interior. Mr. Eagle responded that it does. Commissioner Polcyn inquired about the compatibility of the materials used on the entry and those existing in the lobby of the building. The Commission compared the proposed design

to a copy of a drawing of the entry design from the original blueprints for the building and noted that the proportions are different. The Commission stated that they would prefer to see the new entry designed to have the same proportions as the original with a more contemporary appearance so it would be differentiated from the historic building. The Commission commented that color brochures would be helpful in visualizing the new entry. The Commission commented that a section through the building entry would be helpful.

The Commission unanimously recommended that the Director of Planning approve the project subject to Historic Preservation Officer approval of the following conditions and changes to the proposed plans:

- enhanced scale of the stiles and metal surrounds more consistent with the original proportions of the entry,
- review of the details of the metal surface,
- a cross section to evaluate the scale and massing of the entrance,
- a color brochure or sample of entry material and finishes.

The Commission stated that with staff review and approval of the proposed changes this project would not return to the Commission for review (7-0-0 unanimous).

- b. HP01-12-018. Historic Preservation permit to allow a minor change to the previously approved aluminum storefront on the Jose Theatre City Landmark (HL91-53) located at 62-64 S. Second Street. Owner: Redevelopment Agency. Developer: Comedy Club of San Jose, LLC. Council District: 3. CEQA: Exempt.

Courtney Damkroger, Historic Preservation Officer, provided a project summary and indicated that staff supports the proposed change finding that it is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

John Olson, PAC*SJ representative, asked about the status of the historic ticket booth and inquired why it was not proposed to be used. Lisa Mulvany, Redevelopment Agency staff, responded that the historic ticket booth is in a safe storage area, consistent with requirements of their permit. She responded that it would not function as the ticket booth in the new project due to its condition and also because there are significant ADA and egress issues with a freestanding ticket booth in the entry-way of the new building. Commissioner Youmanns suggested that limestone material be used under the proposed ticket window to maintain continuity with the materials on the front elevation of the theatre. Mr. Boldino, representing the Comedy Club of San Jose, LLC, responded that he supported extension of the limestone base under the ticket window.

The Commission voted unanimously to recommend approval of this project as proposed with the exception that the aluminum kickplate would be replaced with the limestone base to be consistent with the rest of the façade. (7-0-0 unanimous).

5. REFERRALS TO THE COMMISSION

- a. SF01-07-045. Single Family House permit for a project located at 485 S. 15th Street (Naglee Park Conservation Area) to allow remodeling, first floor addition of approximately 320 square feet and proposed new second story approximately 1,755 square feet in the R-1-8 Single-Family Residence Zoning District. Owner/Developer: Lorance Wilson. Council District: 3. CEQA: Exempt.

Ms. Damkroger reported that, as a matter of public disclosure, an e-mail was transmitted regarding this project prior to the Commission meeting. She also commented that the City uses the Single-Family Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as a guide in reviewing projects involving historic resources.

Susie Pineda, Planning staff, explained that the Commission reviewed and commented on an addition/remodel project for this structure at its October 3, 2001 meeting. She summarized the recommendations of the Commission, including their recommendation to review a revised proposal at a future date. She commented that the applicants worked with staff and revised their proposal. Ms. Pineda reported that staff supports the proposed project, noting that it is a good faith effort to meet the intent of the Single Family Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Lorance Wilson, owner, introduced his architect Kevin Mequet, who provided a brief introduction to the project and was available to answer questions. Mr. Mequet stated that the revised proposal reduced the floor area ratio from 37.4 to 36.3. A survey of homes in the area was conducted by the applicants finding that 45 homes were 3,000 square feet or greater.

John Olson, PAC*SJ representative, spoke in opposition to the proposed project noting that he believes the proposal is a monster house. He commented that the project does not meet the height exceptions outlined in the Single Family Design Guidelines and it is not compatible with the surrounding neighborhood. He commented that the design guidelines recommend greater setbacks and a larger percentage of the new second story addition to be located over the rear of the first story. He commented that the rationale of these guidelines is to reduce the perceived size of the new addition. Mr. Olson circulated photographs of 21 buildings on the block to the Commission.

Commissioner Polcyn stated that he would abstain from commenting and voting on this project due to the fact that he lives in close proximity to the owners.

Commissioner Paim asked if the proposal would preserve the existing dormer. Mr. Mequet responded that it would. Commissioner Paim commented that the new dormer proposed at the top of the second story overpowers the original and recommended that it be removed. The Commission asked how wide the original structure is and how wide the new project would be. Mr. Mequet responded that the original structure is 30'-6" and the proposed building width would be 45'.

Ms. Damkroger distributed a copy of Preservation Brief #14 at Commissioner Sciara's request. Commissioner Sciara referred the rest of the Commission to the Preservation Brief which poses questions to assist in determining whether a proposal for a new addition is sensitive to the historic building. Ms. Sciara stated that with regard to the Brief the proposal does not preserve enough of the historic features as it is too massive an addition and that the proposed addition is not differentiated from the existing home. Ms. Sciara also noted that setting back the new addition into the backyard would provide an opportunity to preserve more of the original home. Commissioner Dunning reiterated Commissioner Sciara's comments. Commissioner Youmanns noted that 57% of the addition is located over the back while the Single Family Design Guidelines recommend 60 to 70 %.

The Commission found that the proposal was not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the Single Family Design Guidelines, making the following findings:

- The proposal does not preserve significant historic materials and features and the proposed house absorbs the historic house.**
- The proposal does not preserve the historic character and while making a better attempt at keeping the same architectural style, the proposed project mimics some of the elements of the historic house.**
- The massing is too great and while the proposal is under the preferred Floor Area Ratio of the Single Family Design Guidelines, the lot is large and the perceived massing from the street is still problematic.**

The Commission voted to forward these comments to the Planning Commission and recommend this project be denied and request that it be redesigned (6-0-1 Polcyn abstained).

6. GENERAL BUSINESS

- a. Discussion regarding deaccessioning items from the City's Collections.

Melissa Johnson, representative from History San Jose, presented photographs of the items to be deaccessioned to the Commission and was available to answer questions. Commissioner Dunning commented that she is the Historic Landmarks Commission representative serving on the Collections Committee and has seen most of the items

suggested for deaccession. The Commission unanimously recommended that all of the items be deaccessioned from the City's Collections.

b. Commissioner Paim presentation on Façade Easements

Commissioner Paim requested that this item be deferred until the February meeting.

c. Discussion regarding future surveys and volunteer efforts

Ms. Damkroger reported that this item was placed on the agenda at the request of Chair Wachtel from the December meeting. Chair Wachtel reported that she spoke with representatives from the Shasta Hanchett Park Neighborhood Association and the Campus Community Association and they both expressed support for the idea. Ms. Damkroger commented that there are good and bad examples of communities that have tried this approach. She suggested that a small focused working group be established to focus on survey work with some assistance from staff. She also commented that San Francisco is currently doing a similar project and the working group could contact them to obtain more information. Commissioner Dunning commented that Los Gatos completed a survey project using volunteers and offered to obtain some of the documents they used as an example. Commissioner Emeritus Douglas commented that a survey was done in the 1970's that involved interviewing the occupants of the houses. He noted that the results were probably still at the Main Library.

The Commission appointed a subcommittee to look into this matter further. The subcommittee members are Commissioners Polcyn, Dunning, Wachtel and Commissioner Emeritus Henderson. Charlene Duval, Franklin Maggi and Leslie Dill agreed to provide working experience to the subcommittee.

d. Consideration of the Free House National Register Nomination

Ms. Damkroger provided a summary of the proposed nomination and requested that the Commission provide comments for the State Office of Historic Preservation.

The applicant based the National Register Nomination on Criterion B, the building's association with the lives of significant persons, namely Miss Lillian MacNeal Palmer and Arthur Monroe Free, as well as under Criterion C, for its architecture.

Commissioner Youmanns commented that in his research, he did not find Congressmen Free to be very significant in the creation of Moffet Field and believes the connection with Julia Morgan to be somewhat nebulous. The Commission noted that Miss Palmer was a significant artist and one of the top people in her field within California. She is associated with the American Arts and Crafts movement. Commissioner Emeritus Douglas stated that Free did play an important role in the history of Moffet Field.

The Historic Landmarks Commission voted to support a National Register Nomination for this structure.

7. GOOD AND WELFARE

a. Report from the Redevelopment Agency

- 494 S. Almaden Avenue—presentation by Anderson Brule Architects

Jim Allen Young, representative from Anderson Brule Architects, presented the project proposal to the Commission. The historic home will be a part of a larger project with new construction for the Our House Youth Center at South Third and William streets. The project is at the conceptual stage. There was discussion regarding recreating/rehabilitating a porch on the front facade as well as discussion regarding the type of fenestration appropriate for the structure. The Commission supported the proposed project. Commissioner Paim suggested that they utilize “A Field Guide to American Houses” as a resource to assist in determining appropriate porch and window treatments.

- Century Center Redevelopment Area Plan and Mixed Use EIR

Ms. Mellon reported that it is anticipated that the draft EIR would be circulated at the end of January.

- Houghton Donner House

Ms. Mellon reported that the Redevelopment Agency is in negotiations with the owner to purchase the property.

- St. James Park Master Plan

Ms. Mellon reported that the project has been dormant due to the parking garage discussion for the park. She reported that the schematics are now being prepared. Meetings with the Task Force are anticipated to be held in February. A design for the park will be brought to the Landmarks Commission in March and then to the Redevelopment Agency Board for final approval.

- History Walk sign for Germania Building

Ms. Mellon reported that the Redevelopment Agency is obtaining bids on the signage.

- 27 E. William Street

Eugene Sakai, Christopher Fuselier, and Nicole Segal presented the loft project to the Commission. They propose to convert a former automotive facility into live/work units. They noted that this project was previously reviewed by the Design Review Subcommittee of the Commission and several subcommittee recommendations were incorporated into the revised design.

The Commission supported the proposed project. Commissioner Paim suggested that when the project returns to the Commission for a formal referral, the plan set should include a section illustrating how the need construction is set back from the front of the building. In addition Commissioner Paim suggested graphics showing the profile of adjacent buildings.

b. Report from the Secretary

- **Street renaming of frontage road parallel to Hwy. 87**

Ms. Damkroger reported that the City Council is expected to hold a public hearing on the renaming of this road in early February. She commented that following Commission suggestions of either Pueblo Viejo or a name commemorative of Chinatown, Franklin Maggi confirmed the closer proximity of the road to the Pueblo. El Pueblo Viejo was forwarded to the Planning Commission from the Landmarks Commission with the support of the Design Review subcommittee. The Planning Commission recommended Guadalupe Parkway Frontage Road. The matter will be resolved at City Council.

- **Notes from the November retreat**

Ms. Damkroger distributed notes from the retreat held in November 2001.

- **Conservation Areas**

Ms. Damkroger distributed a copy of the Informational memo that was given to the City Council regarding a process for creating Conservation Areas in the City. She also reported that City Council approved the use of historic street lights in Conservation Areas and Historic Districts.

Ms. Damkroger reported that the City website will soon advertise for new Commissioners because Chair Wachtel and Commissioner Dunning's terms both end in June 2002.

Commissioner Emeritus Henderson requested that the deadline to submit comments on the Draft Design Guidelines should be extended beyond January 16 so the Commission and interested individuals have more time to understand and make thoughtful comments on the document. Dolores Mellon agreed to discuss the schedule with Redevelopment Agency staff and try to extend the deadline.

c. Report from the Subcommittees

- Civic Plaza Environmental Impact Report Issues

No update.

- Historic Preservation Guidelines Process

A study session was held prior to the meeting to review the draft Downtown Commercial District Design Guidelines.

- Standard permit language for Historic Archeology

Susie Pineda distributed a project schedule to the Commissioners with an anticipated completion date of April 2002.

- St. James Park

No update.

d. Written Petitions and Communications

8. ADJOURNMENT

PBCE002/historic/1-9-02syn

C: Dolores Mellon, SJRA
Kelly Kline, SJRA
Bea Bea Jimenez, SJRA
Akoni Danielsens, PBCE